



City of Carmel

CARMEL PLAN COMMISSION SPECIAL STUDIES COMMITTEE THURSDAY, MARCH 31, 2005 Minutes

The Special Study Committee met at 7:00 PM Thursday, March 31, 2005 in lieu of the first Tuesday in April due to the Carmel School system spring break. Committee Members in attendance: Jerry Chomanczuk, Wayne Haney, Mark Rattermann.

Jon Dobosiewicz attended the meeting on behalf of the Department of Community Services.

The Special Studies Committee considered the following items:

1. Docket No. 04120013 ADLS Amend: David Kristoff DDS

The applicant seeks approval for signage and associated landscaping. The site is located at 1040 North Range Line Road. The site is zoned B3 and is in the US 31 Overlay. Filed by Jennifer Nally.

Paul Reis, attorney, 8888 Keystone Crossing, Indianapolis appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. Jennifer Nally, business manager for Kristoff dentistry was also in attendance.

Topic of conversation is the ground sign on US 31 south of Speedway Gas Station. The ground sign proposal now matches the Hunter Green colors incorporated in the ground sign along Range Line Road and following the suggestions of the Committee regarding the stone base and the corporate appearance of the sign.

Previously, a wall sign was approved. However, the petitioner cannot utilize three signs without a variance. The two ground signs can go forward at this point without a variance. If the petitioner chooses to put up a third sign, a variance would be required.

This particular building potentially could become a multi-tenant, ground floor building. If that were to occur, the sign package would have to be altered as noted in the Department Report.

Department comments, Jon Dobosiewicz. The Department is recommending approval after all comments and concerns have been addressed. One issue is future sign modifications in the event of additional tenants. The placement of the sign in conjunction to US 31 is in compliance.

Wayne Haney commented that the sign is difficult to read with the triangle. The object of a sign is to give information and attract attention—it is difficult to make out the names of the dentists.

Paul Reis said the “Family Dentistry” will be illuminated, not the individual dentist’s name.

Mark Rattermann moved for approval of **Docket No. 04120013 ADLS Amend, David Kristoff DDS**, seconded by Wayne Haney, **APPROVED 3-0**

2. Docket No. 04120025 ADLS Amend: Wagner Reese and Crossen

The applicant seeks approval for expanded parking, signage, and associated landscaping.

The site is located at 11939 N. Meridian Street. The site is zoned B6/Business and is in the US 31 Corridor Overlay.

Filed by Paul Reis.

Paul Reis, attorney, 8888 Keystone Crossing, Indianapolis, appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. Steve Wagner, one of the partners in the law firm, was also in attendance.

This particular property at 11939 North Meridian Street was formerly occupied by a dentist and subsequently purchased by the law firm. The building has now undergone a massive renovation, both interior and exterior. Even though not required, the petitioner has provided significant new landscaping to “dress up” the building and make it much more attractive. However, the landscaping does need to be approved under the ADLS requirement of the US 31 Overlay zone. The proposed landscaping around the ground sign is also being presented this evening.

Both the site plan and the landscape plan have been reviewed at Technical Advisory Committee, and all issues raised have been answered. The Development Plan adds additional parking to the east of the building and slightly to the north as well as a dumpster enclosure.

The law firm is proposing a ground sign as well as a wall sign. The Department Report reflects no issues with regard to the ground sign as proposed. However, Jon Dobosiewicz had expressed some concern regarding the size of the wall sign, in particular, the law firm name essentially spans the entire face of the sign. Paul Reis reduced the size of the sign by 20% in an attempt to make the sign visible. The sign contractor has said that there may be a problem taking the individually illuminated, back-lit letters down to one foot in size. The sign company suggested a 15% reduction, and this is being submitted at present. The petitioner would like to have the sign initially proposed (as shown) however, the petitioner is willing to discuss a reduction.

Paul Reis stated that the ground sign is not within a current right-of-way limit. This particular piece of property was built in the ‘70’s before the last up-grade of US 31. As a result, the land owned to the centerline of the old road that went northeast; the old road has since been abandoned by the State Highway. The State installed the new Old Meridian Street that is at a 90-degree angle and the prior right-of-way has been abandoned. By operation of law, the petitioner actually owns to the centerline and that is the proposed location of the ground sign.

Department Comments, Jon Dobosiewicz: The ground sign was discussed with the petitioner; the Department will be given a letter that illustrates conformance. There is no issue with the placement of the ground sign in proximity to the right-of-way. The building sign and the original drawing were also discussed. As reduced by 20%, the sign is still 54 square feet and is adequate. The website for the attorneys at the bottom of the sign makes it look a lot larger. The larger wall sign will require a variance approved by the BZA. There was a question regarding the letters—the illustration shows internally illuminated channel letters—Paul Reis concurred. The Ordinance permits 40 square feet per sign, limited by the size of the building and the proximity of the right-of-way—a significant distance from the street. The Department is supportive of the sign if the “Wagner, Reese and Crossen” is counted as one square footage and then simply add the square footage of the tagline/slogan, “injury attorneys.com.” If the name and the slogan each had a box around it and totaled 40 square feet, the Department would support the request.

There was dialogue between Mark Rattermann and Paul Reis regarding whether or not the ground is right-of-way or state owned property. Paul Reis further explained that the subject property does abut the right-of-way and the Department is in agreement.

Jerry Chomanczuk questioned site development regarding the drainage. Also, the website on the sign looks like an after-thought. Paul Reis said it is important to the law firm to have the website on the sign, although they have tried to scale it down.

Jon Dobosiewicz commented that the City Engineer had looked at the property and determined that the overall impact is negligible.

Mark Rattermann moved for approval of **Docket No. 04120025 ADLS Amend, Wagner Reese and Crossen, as amended with a 15% reduction in the signage** as suggested by the petitioner, seconded by Wayne Haney, **APPROVED** 3-0.

3. Docket No. 05010043 DP/ADLS: Shoppes at Providence

The petitioner proposes two new 3-story commercial/residential buildings and related parking, signage, and landscaping. The site is located at 12700 Old Meridian Street and is zoned OM/V - Old Meridian/Village Zone.

Filed by Dave Leazenby for Providence Commercial Properties, LLC.

Jim Shinaver, attorney with Nelson & Frankenberger appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. Also in attendance: David Leazenby for Providence Commercial Properties, Gary Murray, Mid-States Engineering, and Mark Smith, MAS Architects.

The petitioner proposes to construct two, three-story commercial buildings with apartment/living units on the second and third floors as well as related parking, signage, and landscaping. The common address of the real estate is 12700 Old Meridian Street and zoned Old Meridian/Village Zone. The property is also subject to Providence Planned Unit Development Ordinance.

The real estate is east of and adjacent to Old Meridian Street; north of Cranston Avenue and south of Providence Boulevard. The overall Providence Development began in 2000 with the construction of residential apartment units located farther to the east. The second phase of development was residential townhomes. What is presented this evening is the third phase of the development—commercial shops with second and third story residential apartments above commercial.

Each building contains approximately 32,922 square feet in size. It is anticipated that there would be approximately five commercial tenants in each building. Again, the second and third floor of each building will contain 24 residential apartments for a total of 48 residential units between the two buildings.

The landscape plan provides for plantings not only along the perimeter of the parking lot, but also plantings internal to the parking lot itself.

Review for this evening relates to the building elevations, building materials, the sign package for the site, and how the PUD Ordinance itself set forth the signage and finally, examples of the outdoor seating facilities.

David Leazenby then addressed the Committee and distributed renderings of the signage and the court plaza seating area. There is a lot of glass on the first floor retail space with the address above each door as well as the signage; there are canopies on the end. There is much less glass on the back of the buildings. Entries to the apartments are at the rear of the building and an elevator that goes to the second and third floor. Additional signage includes the logo created for Providence, the building address, and the address of each of the apartments. There is a post office at Providence already built into the amenity building. In response to earlier comments, the signs have been raised.

Outdoor seating currently exists—there are tables and chairs outside the Café at the end of the amenities building for the residents. The outdoor area would be developed in a similar manner—wrought iron or black painted steel has been included and a railing around the edge would be provided if there were to be a restaurant.

A supplemental brochure will be prepared and renderings included for distribution to the Plan Commission members prior to the Commission meeting of April 19th.

The Lighting Plan has been submitted to the Department.

Department Comments, Jon Dobosiewicz said the only two issues for clarification were illustrations for rooftop-mounted equipment, and the requirement that it would be screened from view. Also, the petitioner has indicated a willingness to prepare either a plat or simple dedication of right-of-way to the 60 foot one-half.

Mark Smith said the parapet wall extends the entire length of the building and is 4 to 8 feet tall and will adequately screen rooftop equipment.

S:\PlanCommission\SpecialStudyCommittee\2005\ss2005mar31

Jerry Chomanczuk voiced concern with the amount of parking—24 loft apartments, 5 retail businesses per building, and parking provided totals 172 spaces. It is questionable whether or not the parking will be adequate.

David Leazenby responded that the apartments are all one-bedroom, and the calculation is usually 1 1/2 space per unit, or 1.75. There is more parking provided on the eastern portion of the site on Georgetown Lane. The existing curb will be removed and parallel parking will be converted to perpendicular to pick up more spaces. The Ordinance dictates one space for every 300 square feet; 5 spaces are being provided per 1,000 square feet, approximately 50% more than is required by Ordinance.

Jon Dobosiewicz explained the on-street parking. Federal Funds were used to build Old Meridian Street—there is a regime that does not like on-street parking. However, on-street parking will be installed along Old Meridian and promoted. The on-street parking would not be built until after the construction of Old Meridian Street and the City took over ownership.

Mark Rattermann made formal motion to forward Docket No. 05010043 DP/ADLS, Shoppes at Providence, to the full Commission with a positive recommendation, seconded by Wayne Haney, approved 3-0.

4. Docket No. 05010042 DP/ADLS: Specialty Risk International

The petitioner proposes a new office building and related parking, signage, and landscaping. The site is located immediately west of 501 Congressional Blvd and is zoned B6/Business.

Filed by Elizabeth Hobbs of Krieg DeVault for Specialty Risk International.

Elizabeth Hobbs, attorney with Krieg DeVault appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. Greg Snelling, engineer was also in attendance.

Liz Hobbs updated the Committee on the following issues. In lieu of a ten-foot asphalt path along 116th Street, the petitioner will install sidewalks from the northwest edge of the Specialty Risk site over to Pennsylvania Street in order to provide connectivity between Congressional and Pennsylvania Street. FYI: REI was not interested in partnering and extending 342 feet along Congressional, primarily because there is currently no connectivity east of the SRI site. The sidewalk from SRI to Pennsylvania would not necessarily go anywhere or serve anyone else other than Specialty Risk International.

With respect to the sewer lift station, REI indicated that nothing had been adopted. AmeriSuites had been constructed east of 11711 North Pennsylvania about two years ago, and there was no issue raised at that time regarding a sewer lift station. The Declaration of Covenants are silent in this regard. The Clay Township Regional Waste has approved the sewer permit for SRI and has also calculated the “tap” fees.

Regarding the right-of-way, it has been requested that Specialty Risk start looking at appropriate dedication per the Carmel Thoroughfare Plan.

The sideyard variance request was filed today and SRI will be appearing before the Board of Zoning Appeals on April 25. The southeast corner of the building encroaches 5.9 feet into the side yard.

Parking Count—calculations compute at 3.5 spaces per 1,000. The calculation was based on the square footage of the building; 199 spaces are required, 202 spaces are in place.

Landscaping: All landscaping issues have been resolved with Scott Brewer; approval has also been received from REI through Julie Christiansen.

Architectural Design: Dean Rains, Access Architecture, addressed the Committee. For purposes of clarification, a model of the structure was displayed. The entry canopy is laminated, clear glass on steel structure, and slopes for water drainage. The screen wall is EFIS, the stucco is darker brick color and raised—the steel structure is hidden by the parapet wall. The yard sign proposed is adjacent to Congressional Boulevard and measures 6.8 X 4.8 feet, brick to match the darker brick with an aluminum-type finish, plexi-glass back panel for the lettering.

Liz Hobbs stated that the petitioner is fully aware of the need to return to Committee for an ADLS Amendment for signage and final approval. If approved as proposed, the petitioner does not need to return to Committee.

Department Comments: Jon Dobosiewicz asked for a contact person at REI—Liz Hobbs named Rachel Martin, 573-6225. Jon said the representation from REI regarding the sidewalk is not consistent with the City's vision regarding connectivity. Also, the elevation identifies a wall sign. The site has two frontages and a total of two signs are permitted. The petitioner said that the ground sign on 116th Street will be eliminated, the other two signs will stay.

Jeerry Chomanczuk commented that with Central Park going in, he could envision a great amount of employees/persons walking from Meridian Technology Park to Central Park and a sidewalk would be warranted.

Jon Dobosiewicz responded that he was certain that if the entities within Technology Park came to the City and wanted to partner to produce the sidewalk, the City would certainly be interested.

Jerry Chomanczuk asked if there were any elements in the design of the building that have a "green design," meaning environmentally correct.

Jon Dobosiewicz further explained that the Department is looking at requiring "Lead Certified" architecture design for buildings. Today, it is not a requirement, however the City is in the process of preparing an Ordinance and it will most likely be a requirement in the future.

The petitioner responded that the building has green-tinted glass that will cut down on heating costs. The roof is also a light color stone that will cut down on cooling costs.

Mark Rattermann made formal motion to **forward Docket No. 05010042 DP/ADLS, Specialty Risk International** to the full Commission with a **positive recommendation**, seconded by Wayne Haney, Approved 3-0.

5. Docket No. 05030009 ADLS Amend: National City Bank (ADLS Amendment)

The applicant seeks approval for the replacement of their ground sign. The site is located at 4775 E. 126th Street and is zoned B3.

Filed by Doug Staley Sr. of Staley Signs for National City Bank.

Doug Staley, Sr. of Staley Signs appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. Becky Kallan of National City Bank was also in attendance.

The petitioner is proposing a change in the existing monument sign, time and temperature, to a new look. The green background will be opaque green with white translucent copy. The white area for the ATM Banking will be translucent with opaque black letters. The brick face will be the color of the building. A decorative top piece has been added to the sign.

The sign will also be moved back behind the leading edge of the parking lot on either side at Gray Road and 126th Street.

Department Comments, Jon Dobosiewicz. The Department had asked that the cabinet face be revised so that the entire area would not be illuminated. With the green area changed to opaque, only the “National City” reads at night.

The National City green color will be opaque and at night, it will look black—during the day it will look green.

Mostly all of the bank locations have ATM machines; however, there are some that do not. The ATM sign is important.

Mark Rattermann moved for approval of **Docket No. 05030009 ADLS Amend, National City Bank (ADLS Amendment)** seconded by Wayne Haney, **APPROVED** 3-0.

6. Docket No. 05030010 ADLS Amend: Hunter's Creek South (ADLS Amendment)

The applicant seeks approval for the replacement of the subdivision south entry features including signage, lighting, and landscaping. The site is located at 13727 Offutt Drive and is zoned R1.

Filed by Mark Webber for the Estridge Companies.

Mark Webber, Estridge Companies appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. The new entryway design for Hunter’s Creek South Subdivision and the Townhomes of Hunter’s Creek.

S:\PlanCommission\SpecialStudyCommittee\2005\ss2005mar31

One comment made by the Department Staff required a letter of approval from the property owner of Lot One and president of HOA for Hunter's Creek. Those persons are George Bauer and his wife, Linda. The Bauers are 30 feet away from the current sign that is in complete disrepair. The sign is old Oak wood fence painted blue. The new sign will be a vast improvement and feature a blend of green and black. The lamp post off the sidewalk will illuminate the sign.

Jon Dobosiewicz: The Department has no issues with the signage.

Mark Rattermann moved for approval of **Docket No. 05030010 ADLS Amend, Hunter's Creek South (ADLS Amendment)** seconded by Wayne Haney and **APPROVED 3-0**.

7. Docket No. 05030017 ADLS Amend: Three Penn Mark Plaza (ADLS Amendment)

The applicant seeks approval the addition of a canopy to an office building. The site is located at 11455 N. Meridian Street and is zoned B6/US 31 Overlay.

Filed by Pam Day for Three Penn Mark Plaza LLC.

Pam Day appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. The petitioner proposes the addition of an awning at Three Penn Mark Plaza for use by a new tenant, a plastic surgeon.

Currently, the entrance is somewhat of a service corridor—there is a lift that will be removed and backfilled, the area will be resurfaced and the awning added. The awning is metal construction, free-standing, with a fabric awning. The colors are anodized aluminum to match the existing building, with a black awning—no signage on the awning.

The free-standing awning will be considered temporary for the use of this tenant while he occupies this space.

Department Comments, Jon Dobosiewicz. This area of the building is almost not visible from the street. The modification has been reviewed with the petitioner and it is felt to be appropriate.

As indicated, this is somewhat a loading dock area that will be converted into a primary entrance and a tenant space. The area is being “dressed-up” so that it will function more appropriately from an aesthetic perspective. The Department is recommending approval.

Jerry Chomanczuk asked what the landlord would do for a loading dock or entranceway for deliveries, etc.

Pam Day responded that a loading dock has not been necessary—it has not been needed. The 40-foot awning will cover a drop-off area and walkway to the vestibule.

Mark Rattermann moved for approval of **Docket No. 05030017 ADLS Amend, Three Penn Mark Plaza (ADLS Amendment)** as submitted, seconded by Wayne Haney, **APPROVED 3-0**.

**8. Docket No. 05030018 ADLS Amend:
West Carmel Marketplace (ADLS Amendment)**

S:\PlanCommission\SpecialStudyCommittee\2005\ss2005mar31

The applicant seeks alterations to the building façade. The site is located at 9901 Michigan Road and is zoned B3/421 Overlay.
Filed by Mary Solada for Duke Construction.

Mary Solada appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. Cindy Schembre, Senior Vice President with Duke Realty was also in attendance.

The ADLS on the West Carmel Marketplace was approved in September and the plat in November. Originally, Marshall's was envisioned as the second tenant from the north space. At this time, the petitioner is requesting that Marshall's be re-positioned to the north end of the building. The change is basically location—not façade, and Marshall's will end up just south of the Super Target.

The petitioner also asked that the Committee approve re-positioning of any tenant in the in-line building administratively, this evening, so that the petitioner would not have to return with the request.

The petitioner understands that if a change in façade were requested, they would need to return to the Committee. At this time, the tenants are being repositioned because their timing issues are different.

Department Comments, Jon Dobosieiwicz. If the Department had approved this administratively probably no one would have noticed. However, the modification was big enough that the Committee involvement was needed. At this time, the Department is asking the Committee to allow them the ability to make these kinds of approvals administratively in the future and for future tenants.

Mark Rattermann moved for approval of **Docket No. 05030018 ADLS Amend, West Carmel Marketplace (ADLS Amendment)** and to also grant the Department the opportunity to move façade and signage to any location within the approved building, seconded by Wayne Haney, APPROVED 3-0.

The meeting was adjourned 9:10 PM.

Jerry Chomanczuk, Chairperson

Ramona Hancock, Secretary